



# FEDERATION OF AMERICAN SCIENTISTS

T: 202/546-3300  
F: 202/675-1010

1725 DeSales Street, NW 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Washington, DC 20036

www.fas.org  
fas@fas.org

## Board of Sponsors

- (Partial List)
- \* Peter Agre
- \* Sidney Altman
- \* Philip W. Anderson
- \* Kenneth J. Arrow
- \* David Baltimore
- \* Baruj Benacerraf
- \* Paul Berg
- \* J. Michael Bishop
- \* Gunther Blobel
- \* Nicolaas Bloembergen
- \* Norman Borlaug
- \* Paul Boyer
- \* Ann Pitts Carter
- \* Morris Cohen
- \* Stanley Cohen
- \* Mildred Cohn
- \* Leon N. Cooper
- \* E. J. Corey
- \* James Cronin
- \* Johann Deisenhofer
- \* Ann Druyan
- \* Renato Dulbecco
- \* Paul R. Ehrlich
- \* George Field
- \* Val L. Fitch
- \* Jerome I. Friedman
- \* Robert Furchgott
- \* Riccardo Giacconi
- \* Walter Gilbert
- \* Alfred G. Gilman
- \* Donald Glaser
- \* Sheldon L. Glashow
- \* Marvin L. Goldberger
- \* Joseph L. Goldstein
- \* Roger C. L. Guillemin
- \* Leland H. Hartwell
- \* Herbert A. Hauptman
- \* Dudley R. Herschbach
- \* Roald Hoffmann
- \* John P. Holdren
- \* H. Robert Horvitz
- \* David H. Hubel
- \* Eric R. Kandel
- \* Jerome Karle
- \* Carl Kaysen
- \* Wolfgang Ketterle
- \* H. Gobind Khorana
- \* Arthur Kornberg
- \* Edwin G. Krebs
- \* Willis E. Lamb
- \* Paul C. Lauterbur
- \* Leon Lederman
- \* William N. Lipscomb
- \* Roderick MacKinnon
- \* Jessica T. Mathews
- \* Roy Menninger
- \* Matthew S. Meselson
- \* Mario Molina
- \* Stephen S. Morse
- \* Ferid Murad
- \* Joseph E. Murray
- \* Franklin A. Neva
- \* Marshall Nirenberg
- \* Douglas D. Osheroff
- \* Arno A. Penzias
- \* Martin L. Perl
- \* Norman F. Ramsey
- \* George Rathjens
- \* Burton Richter
- \* Richard J. Roberts
- \* J. Robert Schrieffer
- \* Andrew Sessler
- \* Phillip A. Sharp
- \* K. Barry Sharpless
- \* Stanley K. Sheinbaum
- \* Robert M. Solow
- \* Jack Steinberger
- \* Joseph Stiglitz
- \* E. D. Thomas
- \* Daniel Tsui
- \* Charles H. Townes
- \* Harold E. Varmus
- \* Frank von Hippel
- \* Robert A. Weinberg
- \* Steven Weinberg
- \* Torsten N. Wiesel
- \* Eric Wieschaus
- \* Herbert F. York

December 6, 2007

J. William Leonard, Director  
Information Security Oversight Office  
700 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20408

Dear Mr. Leonard:

I am writing to call your attention to an anomaly in declassification practice at the Central Intelligence Agency that may warrant the attention and intervention of ISOO. Specifically, I believe that CIA has been improperly withholding declassified information as if it were classified.

The facts of the matter are as follows.

Earlier this week, CIA posted new documents to its online FOIA collection at [www.foia.cia.gov](http://www.foia.cia.gov). Among those new documents was a declassified version of a Clandestine Services History entitled "The Berlin Tunnel Operation, 1952-1956." The cover sheet states that the document was "approved for release" in July 2007.

The same document, as it happens, was also previously reviewed for declassification and "approved for release" in February 2007.

The anomaly that I wish to point out is that the July 2007 version of the document is redacted to a much greater extent than the February 2007 version.

The divergent redactions include individual words, sentences and even whole pages. Thus in the February 2007 version the Berlin Tunnel project code name PBJOINTLY is given (at page i) but in the July 2007 version it has been redacted. Likewise, Appendix A and Appendix B were published in full in February 2007, but censored in full in July 2007. There are numerous other examples.

For the CIA to represent the material that was newly redacted in July 2007 as classified when in fact it has been declassified and published by the CIA itself is, I

## Board of Directors

Tara O'Toole  
*Chair*

Steven Weinberg  
*Vice Chair*

Art Rosenfeld  
*Secretary-Treasurer*

Henry Kelly  
*President*

Rosina Bierbaum  
Philip B. Carter  
Lee Fikes

Richard Garwin  
Nat Goldhaber  
Lawrence Grossman

Eamon Kelly  
Neal F. Lane  
Norman Neureiter

Jane Owen  
Kumar Patel  
Shankar Sastry

Maxine Savitz  
Richard Wald  
Irving Wladawsky-Berger

Col. David R. Franz (Ret.)

Ex officio: Carl Kaysen, Robert Solow, Frank von Hippel

\* Nobel Laureate

believe, a violation of the executive order. It generates confusion and suggests poor quality control, if not something worse.

I hope that ISOO may be able to help clarify the source of CIA's defective declassification practice in this instance and to identify an appropriate corrective.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Steven Aftergood  
Project on Government Secrecy  
Federation of American Scientists  
1725 DeSales Street NW, 6<sup>th</sup> floor  
Washington, DC 20036

Tel.: (202)454-4691  
Email: [saftergood@fas.org](mailto:saftergood@fas.org)

P.S. For your convenience the two disparate versions of the declassified Berlin Tunnel study are attached and may also be found online here:

February 2007 version:

<http://www.fas.org/irp/cia/product/tunnel-200702.pdf>

July 2007 version:

<http://www.fas.org/irp/cia/product/tunnel-200707.pdf>